# Generalized assignment problem to minimize emergency evacuation routing in Istanbul Grand Bazaar 

İlkay Saraçoğlu**, Gül Yücel**<br>*Department of Industrial Engineering, Faculty of Engineering and Architecture, Istanbul Gelisim University, Turkey<br>** Department of Architecture, Faculty of Engineering and Architecture, Istanbul Gelisim University, Turkey<br>(isaracoglu@gelisim.edu.tr, gyucel@gelisim.edu.tr)<br>* Corresponding Author; İlkay Saraçoğlu, Industrial Engineering Dept., Faculty of Engineering and Architecture, Istanbul Gelisim University, Avcılar, Turkey, Tel: +90 2124227000<br>isaracoglu@gelisim.edu.tr

Received: 14.06.2019 Accepted:20.08.2019


#### Abstract

In this study, the exit door assignment problem was discussed to determine routes with the shortest distance and least density for users of Istanbul Grand Bazaar in case of an emergency. The evacuation plan was considered as a Generalized Assignment Problem (GAP) which is a 0-1 mixed integer programming model. The components of the evaluation model consist of length, area, and user density as well as streets in the Grand Bazaar and their connection with the exterior. In the study, 12 gates in the Grand Bazaar which directly open onto roads and 15 nodal points among the junction points which are related to these gates were taken into consideration. A route is suggested with the aim of ensuring safe evacuation with minimum density and in the shortest time in any emergency case. The Grand Bazaar has more than one hundred thousand visitors daily depending on the season due to its characteristics of being the historical trade centre. Based on the study results, it is foreseen that there will be density at some gates in cases of emergency. Any evacuation plan in case of emergency must evaluate these routes and necessary physical precautions should be taken. At the same time, this evaluation may constitute the basis for improvement works devoted to the use of other gates.


Keywords Generalized assignment problem, Emergency evacuation, Istanbul Grand Bazaar

## 1. Introduction

Emergency evacuation at different scales from city to dwelling unit is crucial for the safety of life in any emergency case. The type and scale of disaster and settlement characteristics to be evacuated affect the selection of evacuation methods. Also, the type of hazard that leads to disaster affects the evacuation conditions and if these are also triggered by secondary disasters, safe evacuation conditions may become difficult. The fire risk following an earthquake may constitute a more serious case, along with the postdisaster structural damage and evacuation conditions. Physical aspects of routes such as geometry, width, and length are important for evacuation safety conditions with the user capacity. The historical city fabric, topographic conditions, building typology, scale and routes are some factors that affect safety conditions in emergency evacuation cases. Historical buildings also have similar problems. The horizontal and
vertical circulation routes in new buildings include sufficient geometric design according to codes and standards. But historical buildings which consist of different type, typology and history, may have irrational circulation typology. Historical buildings need special solutions for the evacuation model due to special conditions. Due to weak features in terms of physical conditions, historical cities are at significant risk due to disasters, mainly earthquakes. The special conditions in historical buildings, necessary to protect cultural assets, involve special methods and processes in practice. The procedure for making large-scale historical buildings, used by a high number of users, safe may take a long time. It is also crucial to ensure the safety of individuals living in these buildings and develop fast and safe evacuation conditions for disasters which may occur. The historical bazaars and Han (inn) buildings may be given as examples of these types of buildings. Their scale, number of users, planning and structures appear to be a complicated problem.

In the second section, the literature including studies concerning emergency evacuation is discussed. In the third section, the generalized assignment model is explained. In the fourth section, the implementation model for the Grand Bazaar is considered while solution results are mentioned in the fifth section and finally the conclusion is explained in the last section of the study.

## 2. Literature Review

In terms of emergency evacuation, building complexes can be classified into three types (vertical, horizontal, and both): high-rise buildings have vertical characteristics, so escape routes can be provided by a number of stair ramps. Examples of horizontal architecture can be mentioned as fairgrounds and the examples of the Grand Bazaar. In these buildings, the number of doors is generally higher and access roads to the gates are located at greater distances. Structures such as stadiums are low-rise buildings that have horizontal and vertical structure characteristics in one place. Studies about single-story horizontal structures which have characteristics similar to the Istanbul Grand Bazaar architecture, which is the focus of this study, are examined.

The first study which was conducted with the aim of evacuating large indoor spaces and high-rise buildings in case of emergency mentioned in the literature was modelled by Francis [1]. Pursals and Garzon [2] developed a mathematical model which enables people to select the most convenient route. Kang et al. [3] implemented the method of assignment to last exit with the aim of evacuating a large shopping centre. One of two models that they developed allows for evacuation from different exit points by departmentalising the people based on linear programming, while other method allows for evacuation by directing each department to a single exit based on integer programming. Cuesta [4] conducted a study about the evacuation methodology of a single-floor manufacturing facility. They tested this suggested model with STEPS software which is a commercial application. Chen and Feng [5] used flow control algorithm for evacuation of a large indoor space. They considered the aspects of single narrow door, single wide door, multiple narrow doors, etc. by hand individually. Boonmee et al. [6] applied a facility location model to solve a wide range of emergency humanitarian logistics.

In some studies, the behaviour tendencies of people were analysed with simulations to discover which doors they head towards. Alighadr et al. [7] conducted a simulation study of behaviours of pedestrians for emergency evacuation in Tabriz historical bazaar. They found the maximum density by creating four experiment sets as two exit doors or single exit door by considering four different pedestrian numbers. In another study, Zhang et al. [8] investigated the behaviours of people in subway stations and decided the most convenient evacuation routes with simulation-based decision-making approach.

Mathematical models which will minimize the evacuation period were mostly established in studies about the evacuation
problem in case of emergency. The simulation studies and the studies on behaviour tendencies of people in closed spaces in case of emergency are also reviewed. In this study, the emergency evacuation of people in Istanbul Grand Bazaar was considered based on a 0-1 mixed integer programming model.

## 3. Istanbul Grand Bazaar

The Grand Bazaar in Istanbul is a historical site located north of Beyazit Square. The main building of the Grand Bazaar consists of Cevahir Bedesten (construction date 14551460) and Sandal Bedesten (construction date 1545-1550). The historical records reveal that the Grand Bazaar was damaged due to many earthquakes and fires since its establishment and many repairs were made devoted to fixing the damage [9-13]. Today, the Grand Bazaar maintains its function with two bedestens and 16 Han (inn) buildings, opened onto the bazaar which are interconnected with the surrounding roads within its historical urban fabric. The Grand Bazaar, which has maintenance and repair provisioned by a special law, is registered as a monumental structure and was added into the scope of urban renewal in 2007. The surveying, restitution and restoration projects for the Grand Bazaar which were completed in 2016 were performed by Fatih Municipality (Law No.5366), and today, according to the restoration project, roof and infrastructure renovation are completed.

The change in the bazaar's boundaries after disasters which occurred during history, the change of use in parallel with current conditions, and the maintenance-repair history of the Grand Bazaar which consists of structures with different qualities may be listed as sources of many problems experienced today. The construction deterioration and structural cracks which occurred locally in the street vault cover locally reveal the urgency for maintenance and repair [14,15]. In addition, the resolution of structural problems will be dealt with in the scope of restoration practices; and aspects such as location in the city, area, multiple ownership, structural specification of bazaar and maintaining its function and monumental building status will be effective throughout the restoration. According to Mortan and Küçükerman [16], the accumulation, historical and cultural assets specific to the Grand Bazaar span over five hundred years and its commercial commodity value ( 1.2 billion USD) shows the multidimensional aspect of the issue. All these conditions make the development of a safe evacuation plan urgent. The monumental building value of the Grand Bazaar is determinative for sensitivity of physical interventions which will be made. Therefore, conducting and developing a preliminary study devoted to determining the routes convenient to its physical features and evacuation conditions is prioritized. In this regard, the primary need is to determine the physical condition of current routes and exit doors used and the density of use in the bazaar.

The determination of escape routes which may be insufficient for the earthquake risk shall be considered within this scope. The sectoral distribution in the bazaar, the density of use, escape routes, and wideness and capacities of doors
have a significant place in the determination of safe routes based on integrated analysis. The aim is to carry out studies to determine the routes which may be unsafe in terms of earthquakes and take emergency precautions.

### 3.1. Emergency evacuation planning and safe evacuation structure

Within the scope of emergency evacuation planning for the Grand Bazaar; the roads in the bazaar, road length and
areas, user load/capacity, and exit doors are taken in consideration.

The Grand Bazaar has 21 gates (exit doors) with different specifications which are interconnected to the surrounding area (Figure 1, 2). There are 12 gates which directly open onto the street as well as seven gates which exit onto streets as a gateway by opening onto the Han building (inn) present in the bazaar.


Fig. 1. The Grand Bazaar gate locations on satellite view.


Fig. 2. The Grand Bazaar gate/exit door examples, general view (D01, D05, D07, D16)


Fig. 3. The Grand Bazaar street views

The Han (inn) gate, named Yolgeçen, located on Yağlıkçılar Street which is currently closed was excluded from the evaluation. Two exits are in Kürkçüler Bazaar. All exits which ensure connections with surrounding streets all day are closed at the end of the day. In the study, the gates which are directly opened to streets were selected for evacuation in case of an emergency. The interconnected gates were excluded from the study.

The bazaar plan and map which was used in study was obtained from the municipality. The plan includes streets, shops, gates and bazaar surrounding information in metric form and digital format. The number of shops on streets were collected from the plan. All route information such as road size and width in the Grand Bazaar are taken from the plan as shown in Appendix 1. The physical information for gates is based on the study by Yücel and Arun [15].

### 3.2. Gates/Exit Doors and Density of Use

The user density of the Grand Bazaar gates was evaluated based on on-site observations made within by interviewing Grand Bazaar security teams and observations made for a specific period at every gate. The crowded gates in terms of density of use are gates Çarşıkapı (D05), Beyazıt (D07), Nuruosmaniye (D01), Mahmutpaşa (D18), Mercan (D16) and Örücüler (D14), respectively. The highest number of exits from the bazaar was made from Mahmutpaşa gate (D18). These densities are taken into consideration for the selection of gates which will be used for emergency evacuation. The relationship of main axes to which doors connect, with the city roads and the level of the topography have a significant effect on the density at these entries-exits. There is five metre level difference between the doors at Beyazit (D07) and Nuruosmaniye (D01) and the doors at Çarşıkapı (D03) and Örücüler (D14) from uninterrupted ways. According to sea level, Yorgancılar gate (D11) is located at the highest elevation (52.99), while Mahmutpaşa gate (D18) is located at the lowest level ( 38.34 level). Figure 3 shows some of the Grand Bazaar street views.

### 3.3. User Capacity

The employees in the shops were considered as fixed population in the Grand Bazaar, while the daily visitors were taken as mobile-variable users or population. In this study, the street slope, sectoral gathering and structural specification were not taken into consideration.

## 4. Method

### 4.1. Generalized Assignment Problem (GAP) Model

The aim of study is to ensure the evacuation of persons from the closest point by assigning exit doors which ensure the least density and shortest distance in terms of safe evacuation. The studies which were conducted about assignment problems in the last 50 years were summarized by Pentico [17]. In the most well-known classical assignment problems, the lowest total assignment cost is found by
coupling ' $n$ ' job with ' $m$ ' location exactly. For example; the assignment problems may be given as "activities to locations, jobs to machine, jobs to workers or workers to machines". In this assignment problem, one to one coupling was made. More than one job assignment to one machine or more than one facility assignment to one location is different from the GAP classical assignment problem that Pentico [18] defined in the literature review. GAP was first developed by Ross and Soland [19]. GAP has fields of application in miscellaneous real-life problems such as evacuation, vehicle routing, grouping of flexible manufacturing systems, assignment of ships to docks, assignment of jobs to computers, assignment of facilities to locations, logistic distribution, resource allocation, etc. [20]. The model established based on the distances and number of persons in the evacuation problem to be implemented in the GAP model is given below [17]:

## Notations:

$x_{i j}=$ if agent i assigned to task $\mathrm{j}, 0$ if not
$a_{i j}=$ amount of agent i's capacity used if that agent is assigned to task j
$b_{i}=$ available capacity of agent i
$c_{i j}=$ the cost of assigning agent i to task j

Objective function:
Minimum $\sum_{i=1}^{m} \sum_{j=1}^{n} c_{i j} x_{i j}$
Subject to:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \sum_{i=1}^{m} x_{i j}=1, \quad j=1, \ldots ., n  \tag{2}\\
& \sum_{j=1}^{n} a_{i j} x_{i j} \leq b_{i}, \quad i=1, \ldots, m \tag{3}
\end{align*}
$$

$$
\begin{equation*}
x_{i j}=0 \text { or } 1 \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

The first constraint (2) ensures that every task is assigned to only one agent. The second constraint (3) indicates that the set of tasks assigned to an agent do not exceed its capacity. It is a version of the classic assignment problem allowing for one machine to be assigned more than one job. Each job is assigned to one machine but more than one job may be assigned to one machine. Therefore, GAP may serve as an example for many assignment problems under a capacity limit. The aim is to assign the facilities to locations in such a way to minimize the total cost. At the end of assignment, one facility will be established at each location and no location or facility will remain uncovered. Elshafei [21], Burkard [22], Tsui and Chang [23], and Çela [24] used assignment model. Kang et al. [3] used the activity-exit assignment problem on hand as evacuation from multiple exits and evacuation from a single exit for a mall in Korea. Bretschneider and Kimms [25] developed a mixed integer mathematical model with the aim of ensuring the safe and fast evacuation in case of a disaster

## INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL of ENGINEERING TECHNOLOGIES-IJET

## Saraçoğlu and Yücel, Vol.5, No.3, 2019

which may occur in the city. Vermuyten et al. [26] completed a literature review of optimization models made based on evacuation of pedestrians. Swamy [27] used an assignment model for evacuating people who entirely rely on public transportation in case of a hurricane. No study on evacuation problem of historical grand bazaar was found among the studies conducted. The historical grand bazaar was investigated based on the suggested mathematical model and the most convenient evacuation roads were determined.

### 4.2. Theory /Calculation

## Evacuation Problem of Historical Grand Bazaar Istanbul

At the end of studies, it was decided to use the GAP method with the aim of determining the most convenient route to ensure the evacuation of visitors and employees from the bazaar in the shortest time in case of an emergency which may occur in historical Istanbul Grand Bazaar. A 0-1 mixed integer linear programming model was adapted to solve our problem according to the model described in the previous section. The indices, decision variables, parameters, constraints, and objective function of the suggested model are given below.

Notations:
$i=$ location numbers, $1=1,2, \ldots, m$
$j=$ door numbers, $j=1,2, \ldots, n$
$d_{i j}=$ distance from location $i$ to door $j$
$a_{i j}=$ the area of between location $i$ and door $j$
$f_{i j}=$ the number of people between location $i$ to door $j$
$\rho_{i j}=$ the density of people between location $i$ to door $j$
$s_{i j}=$ the number of store between location $i$ to door $j$
$k=$ average number of people in stores
$b_{j}=$ the capacity of door $i$
$x_{i j}=\left\{\begin{array}{c}1, \text { if location } i \text { is assigned to door } j \\ 0, \text { otherwise }\end{array}\right.$
Objective function:
Minimum $\sum_{i=1}^{m} \sum_{j=1}^{n} d_{i j} f_{i j} x_{i j}$
Eq. (2)-(4) are used the same as in the GAP model.
The objective function (5) is to minimize the loading for multiplication of locations and distance between doors with total number of persons. The multiplication of locations and distance between doors with number of persons which is used as the objective function is calculated based on the following equation (6):

$$
\begin{equation*}
f_{i j}=a_{i j} / \rho_{i j}+s_{i j} \cdot k \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Although there are currently 21 gates/exit doors which can be used to enter or exit the Grand Bazaar, 12 gates were selected which are suitable for exits in case of an emergency event. In addition to these 12 selected gates and the nodal points (junction), 50 locations in total were determined for the assignment for evacuation (Figure 4).


Fig. 4. Istanbul Grand Bazaar plan with gates/exits door and available routes

The capacity allowed to exit from gates was determined based on physical aspects and location of gates. The fixed number of persons per day during the open time of bazaar was determined based on the number of shops in the grand bazaar and on the assumption that on average two people work in these shops. There are approximately 3000 shops in the grand bazaar including the inn buildings which are directly connected with the bazaar. The analysed pedestrian Level of Service (LOS) is based on the measurement of pedestrian
flow rate and sidewalk space in the Highway Capacity Manual HCM [28]. The pedestrian flow rate combining pedestrian speed, density, and volume is equivalent to vehicular flow. The analysis of the sidewalk level of service for the midblock uses the calculation of pedestrians per minute per metre ( $\mathrm{ped} / \mathrm{min} / \mathrm{m}$ ) as the basis for LOS classification A to F level as seen in Table 1 [28]. HCM's LOS criteria are taken into consideration in the study

Table 1. Average Flow LOS Criteria for Walkways and Sidewalks (pedestrian level of service, LOS) [31]

| LOS Level | Space <br> (m²/person) | Flow rate <br> (person/min/m) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| At LOS A pedestrians move in desired paths without altering their movements <br> in response to other pedestrians. Walking speeds are freely selected, and <br> conflicts among pedestrians are unlikely. | $>5.6$ | $\leq 16$ |
| At LOS B there is sufficient area for pedestrians to select walking speeds freely <br> to bypass other pedestrians, and to avoid crossing conflicts. At this level, <br> pedestrians begin to be aware of other pedestrians, and to response to their <br> presence when electing a walking path. | $>3.7-5.6$ | $>16-23$ |
| At LOS C space is sufficient for normal walking speeds, and for bypassing <br> other pedestrians in primarily unidirectional streams. Reverse-direction or <br> crossing movements can cause minor conflicts, and speeds and flow rate are <br> somewhat lower. | $>2.2-3.7$ | $>23-33$ |
| At LOS D freedom to select individual walking speed and to bypass other <br> pedestrians is restricted. Crossing or reverse-flow movements face a high <br> probability of conflict, requiring frequent changes in speed and position. The <br> LOS provides reasonably fluid flow, but friction and interaction between <br> pedestrians is likely. | $>1.4-2.2$ | $>33-49$ |
| At LOS E, virtually all pedestrians restrict their normal walking speed, <br> frequently adjusting their gait. At the lower range, forward movement is <br> possible only by shuffling. Space is not sufficient for slowly walking <br> pedestrians to pass. Cross- or reverse-flow movements are possible only with <br> extreme difficulties. Design volumes approach the limit of walkway capacity, <br> with stoppages and interruptions to flow. | $>0.75-1.4$ | $>49-75$ |
| At LOS F, all walking speeds are severely restricted, and forward progress is <br> made only by shuffling. There is frequent unavoidable contact with other <br> pedestrians. Cross-and reverse-flow movements are virtually impossible. Flow <br> is sporadic and unstable. Space is more characteristic of queued pedestrians <br> than of moving pedestrian streams. | $\leq 0.75$ |  |

The area was calculated as $\left(\mathrm{m}^{2}\right) / 2$ on the assumption that there were $2 \mathrm{~m}^{2} /$ person on average by considering the level C based on the density of persons who walk around the bazaar and the wideness of roads. Ando et al. [28] defined the crowd density as $0.54-3.76$ persons $/ \mathrm{m} 2$.

In this study, the nodes are indicated as N01, N02, .., N28 and shown in Fig. 4. The gates are expressed as D01-N10, D02N11, etc. The gates and nodes as well as the distance between gates $d_{i j}$ are given in Appendix 1. The total number of people $\left(f_{i j}\right)$ is calculated as the sum of the average number of people that visit the Grand Bazaar and the fixed number of people employed the shopping area and is shown in Appendix 2. The loading value $\left(d_{i j} * f_{i j}\right)$ was calculated by multiplying distance and total number of people in the Grand Bazaar. More than one assignment must be made to some gates in order to be able to
assign 50 nodes to 12 gates. Therefore, the exit capacities of some gates were adjusted to be more than 1 based on the wideness of the gates and status of streets on which they open. The capacities of gates $b_{j}$ are given in Table 2. All data are designed as matrix format in the Excel spreadsheet. All matrices are defined as a reference name and then the 0-1 mixed integer linear programming model in Analytic Solver Platform was used to solve the GAP problem. This setting is shown in Fig. 5.

The Solver settings would be:

## Objective function:

Minimize \$AC\$53 (Total Loading)

## Variables.

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL of ENGINEERING TECHNOLOGIES-IJET
Saraçoğlu and Yücel, Vol.5, No.3, 2019

Assignments (\$P\$3:\$AA\$52)

## Constraints:

Assignments_per_door $(\$ A B \$ 3: \$ A B \$ 52)=1$;
Total_per_door $\leq$ Required_per_door ( $\mathrm{P} \$ 53: \$ \mathrm{AA} \$ 53 \leq$ P\$54:\$AA\$54)
Binary:

The GAP model is solved as $0-1$ mixed integer programming model by using Analytic Solver Platform. The model established by the data considered in the study is solved on a PC with the capacity of $\operatorname{Intel}(\mathrm{R}) \operatorname{Core}(\mathrm{TM}) \mathrm{i} 3-4005 \mathrm{U}$ CPU @ $1.70 \mathrm{GHz}, 4.0 \mathrm{~GB}$ RAM in 10.78 seconds with 600 variables and 72 constraints. The below-mentioned solver model was established to obtain the solution assignments matrix given in Appendix 3.

Assignments= binary
Table 2. Capacity of gates/exit doors

| Gates/Exit Doors | D01 | D02 | D05 | D07 | D09 | D11 | D12 | D14 | D15 | D16 | D18 | D20 | Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Capacity | 3 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 6 | 2 | 6 | 6 | 50 |



Fig. 5. The model interface view with the Analytic Solver Platform in Excel
Table 3. The result of assignment to gates/ exit doors

| Gates/ <br> Doors | Locations |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | ---: | N10-N11

Table 3 shows the locations assigned to exit doors/gates and number of people predicted to exit from gates. Based on the results given in Table 3, for example; the evacuation of 1657 people who are located between N10, N08 and N11
nodes may be ensured from D1 gate. It is foreseen that the maximum number of people will be evacuated from D20 gate. The routes suggested for evacuation in case of emergency in the diagram of Grand Bazaar are given in Fig.6.


Fig. 6. The results of evacuation route planning for Istanbul Grand Bazaar

## 5. Results

Based on the results of the model (Fig. 6), the busiest gates in the Grand Bazaar are gates no: D20, D18, D14 and D02. The grid planned road order around the two bedestens indicates that there will be density flow from nodal points specifically around Cevahir bedesten (A in Fig.6) to gates/exit doors. Linear routes play a role in facilitating movement during evacuation. The main axes should be determined for evacuation by taking into consideration that the number of nodes requiring a change in direction for evacuation are high and the density in exit lines may vary based on the number of visitors and in this way, the improvement of escape complicating aspects present on these axes should be planned. The escape in the direction of gates no: D07, D09, D11 and D12 involves various levels of elevation. Having a slope has an adverse effect on evacuation. It may be said that the evacuation will be in the direction of elevation and gates no: D20 and D18 have adverse conditions in this regard. The exit route for gate no: D14 may pose a challenge in evacuation because of the road wideness, length and low possibility of alternative exit ways. In this regard, the road connections for inn buildings which open into the Grand Bazaar and are interconnected with the exterior roads should be improved and
the burden should be placed on the main exit routes.

## 6. Conclusion

In this study, an analytic approach was suggested to provide for the safe evacuation of people who are in indoors in an emergency case, using the most convenient roads and doors without causing a commotion. In addition to this, all roads and doors in the historical Grand Bazaar were investigated and the wideness of roads and accessibility of access areas to exits were also taken into consideration. The evacuation plan was considered as a GAP and $0-1$ mixed integer programming model was suggested for solution. In the model, the evacuation which ensured the least load for evacuation of the Grand Bazaar was created based on distances and number of persons. With mobile applications and indicators as the continuation of this study, the aim is to communicate the most convenient evacuation route to the people in the Grand Bazaar with the help of navigation features.

The implementation of a stochastic programming model may be undertaken in future studies by considering the variability of the number of people in the bazaar. The nodal points within the bazaar which were determined in the study
have different properties. The interconnected nodal points have a homogenous character. Therefore, it will be significant in future studies to consider the efficiency of intermodal variability for evacuation.

Istanbul Grand Bazaar is a whole with its physical dimensions and the culture of commerce it contains. The precaution of protecting the integrity is prioritized. It may be also considered that the economic cost of sectoral discrimination in the bazaar is a disaster risk-increasing factor within the evaluation criteria.

The improvement of current exit doors should be prioritized to ensure safe evacuation conditions. The Grand Bazaar structural conditions should be dealt with together in the determination of evacuation routes. Prioritized planning should be completed for current risky sections. The necessity for ensuring safety in case of a disaster in terms of values that the bazaar incorporates reveals the significance of planning for the evacuation of valuable items-goods.

## References

[1] R. L. Francis, "A 'Uniformity principle' for evacuation route allocation. Journal of Research of National Bureau of Standards", 86, pp. 509-513, 1981.
[2] S. C. Pursals and F. G. Garzon, "Optimal building evacuation time considering evacuation routes" European Journal of Operational Research, 192, pp. 692-699, 2009.
[3] J. Kang, I.-J. Jeong and J.-B. Kwun, "Optimal facility-final exit assignment algorithm for building complex evacuation" Computers \& Industrial Engineering, 85, pp. 169-176, 2015.
[4] O. A. Cuesta, "Real-time evacuation route selection methodology for complex buildings", Fire Safety Journal, 91, 947-954, 2017.
[5] P.-H. Chen and F. Feng,"A fast flow control algorithm for real-time emergency evacuation in large indoor areas", Fire Safety Journal, 44, 732-740, 2009.
[6] C. Boonmee, M. Arimura and T. Asada, "Facility location optimization model for emergency humanitarian logistics" International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction, 24, 485498, 2017.
[7] S. Alighadr, A. Fallahi, J. Kiyono, F. N. Rizqi and M. Miyajima, "Emergency evacuation during a disaster, study case: Timche Muzaffariyye - Tabriz Bazaar". 15WCEE World Conference Earthquake Engineering, (p. Paper No. 3370). Lisbon, Portugal, 2012.
[8] L. Zhang, M. Liu, X. Wu, and S. M. AbouRizk, "Simulation-based route planning for pedestrian evacuation in metro stations: A case study", Automation in Construction, 71, pp. 430-442, 2016.
[9] H. Y. Şehsuvaroğlu, "Kapalıçarşı ve Tarihi. Türkiye Turing ve Otomobil Kurumu", pp. 6-7, 1954.
[10] Ç. Gülersoy, "Kapalı Çarşının Romanı", İstanbul : İstanbul Kitaplığı Ltd. Yayını, 1979.
[11] M. Cezar, "Tipik Yapılariyle Osmanlı Şehirciliğinde Çarşı ve Klasik Dönem İmar Sistemi" İstanbul: Mimar Sinan

Üniversitesi Yayını, Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1985.
[12] A. Batur and G. Tanyeli, "1894 Depremi ve İstanbul'un Tarihi Yapılarındaki Hasar Üzerine Bir Örnekleme Çalışması: Kapalıçarşı", 2.Ulusal Deprem Mühendisliği Konferans1, 244-252, İstanbul, 1993.
[13] W. Müller-Wiener, "İstanbul'un Tarihsel Topografyası", İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 2001.
[14] G. Yücel, "Deprem Tehlikesi ve Tarihi Çarşılar: İstanbul Kapalıçarşı", 3. Türkiye Deprem Mühendisliği ve Sismoloji Konferansı. İzmir: Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi, 2015.
[15] G. Yücel and G. Arun, "Istanbul Grand Bazaar Evacuation System Vulnerability Assessment", Advanced Materials Research, 133-134, pp. 611-616, 2010.
[16] K. Mortan and Ö. Küçükerman, (2007). "Çarşı, Pazar, Ticaret ve Kapalıçarşı", Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, Ankara, 2007.
[17] D. W. Pentico, "Assignment problems: A golden anniversary survey", International Journal of Modern Physics B, 23(2), pp. 169-176, 2007.
[18] G. T. Ross and R. M. Soland, "A branch and bound algorithm for the generalized assignment problem" Mathematical programming, 8(1), pp. 91-103, 1975.
[19] Z. Drezner, "A new genetic algorithm for the quadratic assignment problem", INFORMS Journal on Computing, 15 (3), pp. 320-330, 2003.
[20] A. N. Elshafei, "Hospital layout as a quadratic assignment problem", Operational Research Quarterly, 28 (1), 167179, 1977.
[21] R. Burkard, "Quadratic assignment problems", European Journal of Operational Research, 15 (3), pp. 283-289, 1984.
[22] L. Tsui and C.-H. Chang, "An optimal solution to a dock door assignment problem", Computers \& Industrial Engineering, 23 (1-4), pp. 283-286, 1992.
[23] E. Çela, "The Quadratic Assignment Problem: Theory and Algorithms", Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1998.
[24] S. Bretschneider and A. Kimms, "A basic mathematical model for evacuation problems in urban areas", Transportation Research Part A, 45, pp. 523-539, 2011.
[25] H. Vermuyten, J. Belien, L. D. Boeck, G. Reniers and T. Wauters, "A review of optimisation models for pedestrian evacuation and design problems", Safety Science, 87, pp. 167-178, 2016.
[26] R. Swamy, J. Kang, R. Batta and Y. Chung, "Hurricane evacuation planning using public transportation", SocioEconomic Planning Sciences, 59, pp. 43-55, 2017.
[27] K. Ando, H. Ota and T. Oki, "Forecasting the flow of people", RRR, Railway Research Review, 45(8), pp. 8-14 (in Japanese), 1988.
[28] Transport Research Board. HCM Highway Capacity Manual. Highway Capacity Manual. National Research Council, National Academy of Science, 2000.

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL of ENGINEERING TECHNOLOGIES-IJET
Saraçoğlu and Yücel, Vol.5, No.3, 2019
Appendix 1. Distances from gates to nodes, $\boldsymbol{d}_{\boldsymbol{i} j}(\mathrm{~m})$

| Gates/ Nodes | D01 | D02 | D05 | D07 | D09 | D11 | D12 | D14 | D15 | D16 | D18 | D20 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| D01-N10 | 71 | 130 | 223 | 281 | 308 | 346 | 370 | 410 | 289 | 210 | 205 | 163 |
| D02-N11 | 183 | 81 | 200 | 258 | 285 | 331 | 367 | 439 | 341 | 260 | 256 | 213 |
| D05-N13 | 224 | 202 | 17 | 91 | 118 | 163 | 199 | 272 | 307 | 299 | 294 | 255 |
| D07-N13 | 282 | 260 | 91 | 74 | 175 | 221 | 255 | 330 | 335 | 356 | 351 | 312 |
| D09-N15 | 308 | 286 | 118 | 75 | 28 | 142 | 190 | 300 | 305 | 385 | 325 | 283 |
| D10-N15 | 335 | 312 | 145 | 102 | 85 | 168 | 220 | 326 | 347 | 324 | 352 | 365 |
| D11-N18 | 400 | 377 | 210 | 167 | 150 | 65 | 68 | 391 | 412 | 389 | 417 | 430 |
| D11-N22 | 364 | 360 | 195 | 252 | 158 | 30 | 65 | 210 | 215 | 210 | 232 | 320 |
| D12-N22 | 370 | 365 | 200 | 257 | 192 | 65 | 35 | 214 | 220 | 213 | 237 | 325 |
| D14-N02 | 412 | 407 | 272 | 330 | 313 | 208 | 212 | 105 | 215 | 210 | 280 | 369 |
| D15-N03 | 290 | 283 | 309 | 365 | 323 | 215 | 219 | 215 | 50 | 85 | 158 | 245 |
| D16-N03 | 245 | 241 | 335 | 394 | 335 | 275 | 280 | 210 | 88 | 40 | 115 | 203 |
| D16-N05 | 212 | 206 | 300 | 358 | 313 | 244 | 244 | 317 | 121 | 43 | 80 | 167 |
| D18-N05 | 205 | 200 | 294 | 351 | 306 | 280 | 238 | 310 | 158 | 80 | 35 | 160 |
| D20-N09 | 130 | 160 | 254 | 312 | 283 | 302 | 338 | 411 | 245 | 167 | 160 | 40 |
| N02-N20 | 337 | 336 | 168 | 225 | 194 | 135 | 140 | 159 | 165 | 160 | 206 | 293 |
| N03-N06 | 254 | 247 | 262 | 320 | 276 | 205 | 208 | 217 | 92 | 86 | 122 | 210 |
| N05-N07 | 169 | 163 | 258 | 315 | 288 | 232 | 235 | 280 | 157 | 78 | 72 | 124 |
| N06-N05 | 208 | 202 | 255 | 353 | 269 | 197 | 201 | 254 | 133 | 81 | 76 | 164 |
| N07-N08 | 133 | 127 | 221 | 278 | 253 | 271 | 265 | 309 | 185 | 107 | 101 | 90 |
| N08-N10 | 104 | 98 | 193 | 250 | 277 | 279 | 318 | 343 | 222 | 144 | 137 | 97 |
| N09-N08 | 114 | 120 | 205 | 272 | 245 | 264 | 304 | 330 | 207 | 129 | 124 | 60 |
| N10-N11 | 104 | 98 | 157 | 214 | 240 | 287 | 322 | 390 | 258 | 180 | 172 | 134 |
| N11-N12 | 141 | 118 | 120 | 177 | 204 | 251 | 286 | 358 | 262 | 216 | 210 | 171 |
| N13-N12 | 207 | 184 | 83 | 140 | 167 | 214 | 249 | 322 | 291 | 283 | 277 | 238 |
| N15-N16 | 312 | 289 | 122 | 79 | 62 | 112 | 164 | 271 | 291 | 268 | 151 | 255 |
| N16-N17 | 273 | 239 | 83 | 140 | 92 | 112 | 162 | 250 | 276 | 271 | 262 | 222 |
| N17-N13 | 242 | 220 | 52 | 110 | 137 | 147 | 182 | 256 | 281 | 276 | 267 | 226 |
| N18-N16 | 300 | 338 | 88 | 145 | 91 | 85 | 153 | 224 | 229 | 214 | 286 | 381 |
| N18-N19 | 365 | 342 | 175 | 132 | 115 | 95 | 98 | 421 | 442 | 419 | 382 | 395 |
| N19-N17 | 278 | 256 | 88 | 145 | 172 | 125 | 147 | 220 | 241 | 236 | 213 | 226 |
| N19-N20 | 304 | 281 | 113 | 171 | 140 | 115 | 112 | 185 | 190 | 188 | 178 | 252 |
| N19-N25 | 250 | 227 | 193 | 250 | 160 | 135 | 159 | 230 | 205 | 196 | 190 | 210 |
| N22-N20 | 334 | 333 | 165 | 222 | 191 | 81 | 85 | 210 | 216 | 215 | 203 | 290 |
| N23-N06 | 237 | 232 | 248 | 384 | 331 | 188 | 192 | 246 | 124 | 112 | 107 | 193 |
| N23-N07 | 144 | 138 | 233 | 290 | 346 | 319 | 281 | 317 | 195 | 119 | 112 | 137 |
| N23-N26 | 173 | 145 | 187 | 243 | 269 | 236 | 271 | 344 | 257 | 176 | 170 | 129 |
| N24-N06 | 245 | 240 | 190 | 273 | 301 | 157 | 163 | 235 | 130 | 118 | 113 | 200 |
| N24-N20 | 283 | 251 | 153 | 210 | 192 | 119 | 124 | 197 | 168 | 157 | 152 | 239 |
| N24-N27 | 285 | 262 | 228 | 285 | 259 | 168 | 173 | 185 | 130 | 123 | 163 | 245 |
| N25-N23 | 241 | 205 | 185 | 242 | 268 | 173 | 197 | 252 | 160 | 187 | 181 | 201 |
| N25-N24 | 235 | 213 | 178 | 236 | 209 | 165 | 155 | 228 | 162 | 150 | 145 | 196 |
| N26-N08 | 142 | 153 | 192 | 250 | 224 | 243 | 282 | 352 | 266 | 145 | 140 | 98 |
| N26-N11 | 137 | 114 | 154 | 212 | 239 | 239 | 274 | 348 | 257 | 179 | 173 | 131 |
| N27-N02 | 315 | 293 | 198 | 256 | 225 | 134 | 139 | 135 | 111 | 105 | 176 | 276 |
| N27-N03 | 277 | 296 | 232 | 319 | 260 | 168 | 173 | 170 | 81 | 75 | 146 | 234 |
| N28-N12 | 175 | 152 | 117 | 175 | 202 | 203 | 238 | 311 | 225 | 217 | 211 | 170 |
| N28-N17 | 231 | 208 | 108 | 166 | 148 | 167 | 203 | 276 | 246 | 241 | 230 | 191 |
| N28-N25 | 204 | 182 | 147 | 205 | 178 | 164 | 185 | 260 | 194 | 180 | 205 | 164 |
| N28-N26 | 175 | 152 | 154 | 212 | 186 | 206 | 240 | 314 | 228 | 182 | 177 | 135 |

Appendix 2. The number of people between gates and nodes, $\boldsymbol{f}_{i j}$

| Gates/ Nodes | D01 | D02 | D05 | D07 | D09 | D11 | D12 | D14 | D15 | D16 | D18 | D20 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| D01-N10 | 444 | 700 | 1076 | 1486 | 1730 | 1953 | 1729 | 2667 | 1594 | 1263 | 1232 | 669 |
| D02-N11 | 1046 | 419 | 1018 | 1387 | 1558 | 1523 | 2007 | 2609 | 1902 | 1571 | 1540 | 1067 |
| D05-N13 | 1227 | 1084 | 43 | 453 | 622 | 587 | 734 | 1672 | 1163 | 1180 | 1720 | 1247 |
| D07-N13 | 1506 | 1298 | 361 | 412 | 641 | 770 | 946 | 1952 | 1718 | 1815 | 2000 | 1527 |
| D09-N15 | 1767 | 1558 | 622 | 733 | 163 | 604 | 935 | 1942 | 1433 | 1450 | 1840 | 1633 |
| D10-N15 | 1954 | 1745 | 709 | 660 | 513 | 791 | 998 | 2129 | 1620 | 1637 | 2115 | 1974 |
| D11-N18 | 1661 | 1453 | 597 | 969 | 926 | 143 | 364 | 1605 | 1172 | 1194 | 1377 | 1683 |
| D11-N22 | 2089 | 1904 | 944 | 1209 | 951 | 347 | 458 | 1671 | 1162 | 1179 | 1633 | 2169 |
| D12-N22 | 1831 | 1689 | 700 | 1106 | 811 | 206 | 111 | 1435 | 926 | 943 | 1398 | 2017 |
| D14-N02 | 2537 | 2460 | 1392 | 1764 | 1662 | 1139 | 1155 | 958 | 1128 | 1145 | 1649 | 2295 |
| D15-N03 | 1744 | 1706 | 1438 | 1810 | 1433 | 1102 | 926 | 1408 | 157 | 331 | 835 | 1481 |
| D16-N03 | 1437 | 1497 | 1925 | 2205 | 1765 | 1222 | 584 | 1425 | 331 | 174 | 678 | 1498 |
| D16-N05 | 1413 | 1375 | 1535 | 1907 | 1531 | 1200 | 1089 | 1522 | 428 | 267 | 504 | 1150 |
| D18-N05 | 1382 | 1344 | 1720 | 2092 | 1840 | 1452 | 1469 | 2151 | 868 | 504 | 236 | 1119 |
| D20-N09 | 909 | 871 | 1247 | 1619 | 1633 | 1894 | 2044 | 2575 | 1481 | 1150 | 1119 | 175 |
| N02-N20 | 1861 | 1650 | 714 | 1085 | 983 | 543 | 541 | 1219 | 710 | 727 | 1249 | 1895 |
| N03-N06 | 1616 | 1578 | 1162 | 1534 | 1432 | 991 | 990 | 1445 | 351 | 368 | 707 | 1353 |
| N05-N07 | 1146 | 1107 | 1484 | 1855 | 1862 | 1519 | 1459 | 1917 | 1463 | 565 | 534 | 882 |
| N06-N05 | 1422 | 1383 | 1465 | 1836 | 1477 | 1089 | 1087 | 1973 | 627 | 543 | 512 | 1158 |
| N07-N08 | 1022 | 983 | 1364 | 1735 | 1744 | 1670 | 1579 | 2577 | 1332 | 1001 | 970 | 758 |
| N08-N10 | 586 | 548 | 924 | 1296 | 1466 | 1317 | 1464 | 2394 | 1300 | 969 | 938 | 485 |
| N09-N08 | 734 | 696 | 1072 | 1444 | 1450 | 1503 | 1625 | 2400 | 1306 | 975 | 1118 | 323 |
| N10-N11 | 627 | 537 | 802 | 1174 | 1342 | 1307 | 1484 | 2329 | 1483 | 1152 | 1121 | 648 |
| N11-N12 | 833 | 624 | 599 | 971 | 1139 | 1070 | 1182 | 2084 | 1538 | 1361 | 1326 | 853 |
| N13-N12 | 1186 | 977 | 394 | 765 | 934 | 899 | 1046 | 1984 | 1397 | 1414 | 1662 | 1206 |
| N15-N16 | 1706 | 1497 | 561 | 468 | 341 | 441 | 648 | 1779 | 1270 | 1287 | 1765 | 1462 |
| N16-N17 | 1444 | 1301 | 321 | 693 | 458 | 381 | 635 | 1586 | 1077 | 1175 | 1578 | 1290 |
| N17-N13 | 1349 | 1140 | 204 | 575 | 638 | 546 | 693 | 1631 | 1122 | 1139 | 1591 | 1118 |
| N18-N16 | 1381 | 1388 | 408 | 688 | 428 | 230 | 451 | 1575 | 1068 | 1166 | 1475 | 2073 |
| N18-N19 | 1518 | 1309 | 454 | 825 | 783 | 265 | 509 | 1461 | 1028 | 1050 | 1233 | 1540 |
| N19-N17 | 1396 | 1188 | 332 | 704 | 587 | 435 | 530 | 1468 | 959 | 976 | 1240 | 1297 |
| N19-N20 | 1598 | 1390 | 453 | 825 | 723 | 353 | 402 | 1340 | 907 | 929 | 1112 | 1418 |
| N19-N25 | 1480 | 1271 | 520 | 892 | 790 | 491 | 590 | 1528 | 957 | 974 | 1346 | 1858 |
| N22-N20 | 1720 | 1577 | 623 | 994 | 892 | 264 | 281 | 1388 | 1005 | 1027 | 1160 | 1562 |
| N23-N06 | 1600 | 1561 | 1367 | 1738 | 1379 | 939 | 937 | 1875 | 529 | 557 | 690 | 1336 |
| N23-N07 | 1036 | 980 | 1380 | 1752 | 1546 | 1319 | 1266 | 2204 | 920 | 754 | 723 | 773 |
| N23-N26 | 1010 | 801 | 982 | 1353 | 1348 | 1121 | 1268 | 2206 | 1132 | 1005 | 1182 | 881 |
| N24-N06 | 1705 | 1667 | 1189 | 1560 | 1201 | 761 | 759 | 1697 | 635 | 827 | 796 | 1442 |
| N24-N20 | 1639 | 1431 | 1130 | 1274 | 918 | 477 | 476 | 1414 | 812 | 892 | 991 | 1831 |
| N24-N27 | 1928 | 1824 | 1116 | 1489 | 1166 | 689 | 688 | 1317 | 515 | 532 | 1014 | 1724 |
| N25-N23 | 1450 | 1216 | 973 | 1345 | 1022 | 666 | 822 | 1760 | 952 | 980 | 1113 | 1439 |
| N25-N24 | 1348 | 1140 | 975 | 1347 | 1101 | 650 | 710 | 1585 | 749 | 766 | 1030 | 1488 |
| N26-N08 | 894 | 856 | 1040 | 1411 | 1394 | 1319 | 1466 | 2296 | 1612 | 1134 | 1104 | 631 |
| N26-N11 | 760 | 551 | 732 | 1103 | 1159 | 1083 | 1702 | 2577 | 1265 | 1087 | 1236 | 763 |
| N27-N02 | 1973 | 1865 | 860 | 1232 | 1130 | 817 | 728 | 1105 | 449 | 466 | 970 | 1775 |
| N27-N03 | 1906 | 1802 | 1281 | 1653 | 1407 | 1179 | 852 | 1251 | 303 | 320 | 824 | 1470 |
| N28-N12 | 990 | 782 | 551 | 923 | 864 | 789 | 981 | 1856 | 1223 | 1344 | 1415 | 1078 |
| N28-N17 | 1271 | 1166 | 452 | 824 | 707 | 631 | 779 | 1717 | 1201 | 1218 | 1648 | 1887 |
| N28-N25 | 1284 | 999 | 807 | 1178 | 962 | 787 | 872 | 1747 | 1097 | 1114 | 1362 | 1176 |
| N28-N26 | 1125 | 841 | 981 | 1083 | 996 | 921 | 1113 | 1988 | 1338 | 1318 | 1393 | 920 |

Appendix 3. The assignment results of locations

| Gates/Nodes | D1 | D2 | D5 | D7 | D9 | D11 | D12 | D14 | D15 | D16 | D18 | D20 | Total assignment | Total Loading |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| D01-N10 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 31.524 |
| D02-N11 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 33.939 |
| D05-N13 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 731 |
| D07-N13 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 30.488 |
| D09-N15 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 4.564 |
| D10-N15 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 43.605 |
| D11-N18 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 9.295 |
| D11-N22 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 10.410 |
| D12-N22 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 3.885 |
| D14-N02 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 100.590 |
| D15-N03 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 7.850 |
| D16-N03 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 6.960 |
| D16-N05 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 11.481 |
| D18-N05 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 8.260 |
| D20-N09 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 7.000 |
| N02-N20 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 193.821 |
| N03-N06 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 32.292 |
| N05-N07 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 38.448 |
| N06-N05 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 38.912 |
| N07-N08 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 68.220 |
| N08-N10 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 60.944 |
| N09-N08 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 19.380 |
| N11-N12 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 73.632 |
| N10-N11 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 65.208 |
| N13-N12 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 32.702 |
| N15-N16 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 21.142 |
| N16-N17 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 42.136 |
| N17-N13 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 10.608 |
| N18-N16 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 38.948 |
| N18-N19 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 25.175 |
| N19-N17 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 29.216 |
| N19-N20 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 45.024 |
| N19-N25 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 66.285 |
| N22-N20 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 23.885 |
| N23-N06 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 73.830 |
| N23-N07 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 80.976 |
| N23-N26 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 113.649 |
| N24-N06 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 89.948 |
| N24-N20 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 59.024 |
| N24-N27 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 66.950 |
| N25-N23 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 115.218 |
| N25-N24 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 121.338 |
| N26-N08 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 61.838 |
| N26-N11 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 62.814 |
| N27-N02 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 49.839 |
| N27-N03 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 24.543 |
| N28-N12 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 118.864 |
| N28-N17 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 48.816 |
| N28-N25 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 181.818 |
| N28-N26 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 124.200 |
| Total loading | 3 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 6 | 2 | 6 | 6 | 50 | 2.630 .225 |
| Total Capacity | 3 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 6 | 2 | 6 | 6 | 50 |  |

